

25 October 2019

Julia Williams
Principal Analyst
Independent Pricing and Regulatory Tribunal
Level 15, 2-24 Rawson Place
Sydney NSW 2000

Axess Advisory 6 Middlemiss Street Lavender Bay NSW 2060 Australia

T: + axessadvisory.com

ABN 73 602 165 417

Dear Julia,

## Re: CP17 - Cost of Pedestrian Bridges

This letter responds to the reasonableness of revised costs provided by The Hills Shire Council for two CP17 pedestrian bridges:

- RT8 Northern Pedestrian Bridge located at the intersection of Pennant Street and Castle Hill Road; and
- RT9 Southern Pedestrian Bridge located at the intersection of Pennant Street and Castle Street.

Our initial assessment (21 August 2019) noted there was insufficient information available to independently assess the reasonableness of the cost estimates provided by The Hills Shire Council for the pedestrian bridges. It was recommended that further work be undertaken to define the scope of the proposed pedestrian bridges to inform the independent assessment.

The original information provided was based on two pedestrian bridge examples located elsewhere at Windsor Road and Memorial Avenue. No site-specific information was made available for assessment of the proposed RT8 and RT9 pedestrian bridges.

In response to the initial assessment, The Hills Shire Council used the three bridges identified in a) to c) below as benchmarks for RT8 and RT9. The benchmark bridges are:

- a) Beecroft Road Pedestrian Bridge, Beecroft
- b) Pennant Hills Road Pedestrian Bridge, North Parramatta
- c) Kirrawee Pedestrian Bridge

It is noted that the revised cost estimates neither consider site-specific costs nor site-specific scope to inform an assessment.



## Other Comments

Beecroft Road Pedestrian Bridge, Beecroft – The supporting evidence is based on an RMS announcement for \$5 million of funding. This funding provision is likely to cover the total cost from planning through to completion of the project including potential property acquisitions.

Pennant Hills Road Pedestrian Bridge, North Parramatta – The \$3.5 million contract value for this pedestrian bridge would require verification. It is noted that the cost estimate includes lift shafts. Memorial Avenue pedestrian bridge does not include lifts.

Kirrawee Pedestrian Bridge – The information provided does not include the scope of works or drawings to enable assessment.

To confirm that the bridges for Beecroft Road, Pennant Hills Road and Kirrawee Pedestrian Bridge are valid benchmarks for RT8 and RT9, more detailed information on scope and design of the bridges is required.

In conclusion, Axess and CCHD find the revised cost estimates provided by The Hills Shire Council unreasonably high due to the lack of supporting information for RT8 and RT9 pedestrian bridges.

Yours Sincerely,

Bobby Yang

Director of Engineering Services